

Comparison of Academic Performance in Hindi of Students Studying in Government and Private Primary Schools

Dr. Samriti

Assistant Professor in Kullu College of Education, Vill. Bohgana, P.O. Garsa, Distt Kullu

Himachal Pradesh- 175141

Abstract

Primary education means the education which is given to those children who fall in the age group of 6-14 years. The primary education puts emphasis to teach the 3R's with a vision to develop the child with an ability to read and write Hindi language. Education in India is provided by the public sector as well as private sector. The private schools are increasing day by day in the rural areas. The present piece of research seeks to compare the academic performance of students studying in government and private primary schools. The purpose of the study is to examine which type of school is better in their academic performances.

A. Introduction

The educational structure is the largest structure in India, and Primary Education is seen as the first step in laying the foundation for future educational opportunities and lifelong skills. Government schools are run by government agencies or are funded by the government at state and federal levels. The government schools have lower fee structure as they are mostly funded. The number of private schools in the rural areas is increasing. The private school is funded by a private organization or an NGO. At first glance, it is clear to everyone that private schools have got more facilities, better equipments, and buildings but heavy study load as compared to the government schools. The fee structure is also higher in private schools.

Every parent expects that his/her child gets the best education in the best school. Parents value good quality education and are willing to pay for it. Apart from the tuition fee, parents incur considerable expenditure to send their children to a private schools spending money on uniform and text books, which they can otherwise avail for free in a government schools. Making free and compulsory education for students up to 14 years, providing mid-day meal, distributing free dresses, free travel in government buses has not demonstrated effective result in averting students from opting for private schools. The parents are much concerned about the quality dimensions of learning of their children. Parents have a perception that the flaws of government schools can be overcome by preferring to private schools, so parents send their children to private schools.

The review of literature indicate that private schools are becoming more favourite and attractive for majority of the students due to their better education systems, test criteria and knowledge creation vis-a-vis public schools. The quality of Education is generally higher at private schools than at public schools. Achievement differences in government schools were less than in private schools. Presence of repeaters in government schools depressed the achievement levels. In terms of performance of students, private school students outperform the students from government schools in reading, writing in Hindi tests. Evidence from surveys in a number of developing countries including India show that learning outcomes in private schools are on average better than the government schools. Overall, findings indicated that the average private school mean score was higher than the average public school mean score. In view of this, the investigator selected the present problem for research.

B. Research Question

In view of the statement of the problem, the present study will attempted to answer the following research question:

Do the students studying in government and private primary schools differ in terms of their achievement level in Hindi?

C. Objective of the Study

The following objective was laid down for the present investigation:

To compare the students studying in government and private primary schools with respect to their level of achievement in Hindi.

D. Hypothesis of the Study

The following hypothesis was formulated which will be tested in the present study:

The students studying in government and private primary schools differ significantly with respect to their level of achievement in Hindi.

E. Delimitation of the Study

The present study was restricted in the following aspect:

The study will be delimited to comparison the students studying in Government and Private primary school located in territorial jurisdiction of Himachal Pradesh.

F. Operational Definitions of Terms Used

Certain terms were used in the present study quite frequently. The operational meanings of such terms are given below.

Government Primary School: A Government Primary School refers to a school managed and financed by State Government and comprising Standards I to V.

Private Primary School: A Private Primary School refers to a school managed and financed by private individuals/organization comprising Standards I to V.

G. Method

The objective laid down for the present study confirms to all the characteristics of descriptive method. Hence, descriptive method of research was used in the present study.

H. Sample

The sample for the present study was drawn from 85 primary and middle schools situated in eight districts of Himachal Pradesh i.e. Kangra, Bilaspur, Hamirpur, Kullu, Shimla, Solan, Mandi and Lahul & Spiti. The eight districts were selected on the basis of random sampling.

The data for the present study was collected personally by the researcher. The investigator collected data from students immediately after they passed class I, II, III, IV, V. so realistically data was collected from classes II, III, IV, V, VI and was practically considered for classes I, II, III, IV, V. The schools were selected on the basis of convenience, though it was observed that they were spread over a wider area in the district. If the number of students in a class was five or less than five, all the students of that class were included in the sample. If the number of students in any class was more than five, then five students were selected randomly from the class.

In all 250 students were taken from each of the eight selected districts out of which 125 students were from private schools and 125 were from government primary schools. Finally the total sample comprised of 2000 students, 1000 from private and 1000 from government primary schools.

I. Tool Used

Academic Performance Tests

In order to assess the level of academic performance of the students studying in government and private primary schools in Hindi, the methodology adopted by Annual Status of Education Report (2015) facilitated by Pratham with some modifications was used.

Hindi Reading Skill Test
Hindi Writing Skill Test

J. The Procedure

The data for the present study was collected personally by the researcher in accordance with the Academic Performance Test.

k. Analysis and Interpretation of Data

The objective of the present study was to study the level of academic performance in Hindi of students studying in government and private school students of Himachal Pradesh. The data for the study was collected from 2000 students studying in government and private primary schools using relevant tools. The data thus collected was tabulated variable-wise and analyzed and interpreted using appropriate statistical techniques. The details of analysis and interpretation of data are discussed in the following pages.

Comparison of Academic Performance in Hindi of Students Studying in Government and Private Primary Schools

The students studying in government and private primary schools were compared with respect to their academic performance in Hindi. As discussed in earlier, in order to assess the level of academic performance of the students studying in government and private primary schools in Hindi, the methodology adopted by Annual Status of Education Report (2015) facilitated by Pratham with some modification was used. The details of these comparisons are presented below.

Hindi Reading Skill

The Hindi Reading Skill Test consisted of four sections – letters, words, paragraph and a story which was meant for students of classes I to V.

Letters: This section consists of a set of ten letters from Hindi alphabet.

Words: This section consists of ten common familiar words with two letters and one or two mantras.

Sentences: This section consists of a set of four simple linked sentences, each having not more than 5 words. These words or their equivalent exist in the standard I text book of the state.

Story: This section consists of 8 sentences. Sentence construction is straight forward, words are common and the context is familiar to the children. These words or their equivalent exist in the standard II text book of the state.

The preliminary drafts of four sections of Hindi Reading Skill Test prepared by adopting the concept of minimum level of academic attainment in Pratham's ASER (2015) with necessary modifications were shown to some primary school teachers. The teachers were made acquainted with the purpose of test and were requested to give suggestions with respect to the choice of words and sentences and difficulty level of the content. Two changes were made on the basis of their suggestions. This also ensured the content validity of the test. The final draft of four sections of the Hindi Reading Skill Test is given below.

पढ़ने की जाँच

अक्षर		
अ	च	ट
त	इ	
स	य	ज
छ	ग	

शब्द

राखी		नींद
भूल	जीभ	वृक्ष
मित्र		खून
	बीज	
मंत्र		पूर्ण

अनुच्छेद

पंछी जागे, हुई है भोर,
रोशनी हो गई चारों ओर।
सूरज ने है मुँह दिखलाया,
संग अपने है किरण लाया।

कहानी

रविवार का दिन था। पलक खेलते-खेलते थक गई। वह दोपहर को पलंग पर सो गई। उसका भाई रजत भी सो गया। गहरी नींद में पलक ने सपना देखा कि पाठशाला में बालमेला मनाया जा रहा है। जिसमें पलक ने सफेद परी वाली फ्रॉक तथा रजत ने मदारी वाली पोशाक पहनी हुई थी। दोनों भाई-बहन फैसी ड्रेस में प्रथम आए। पलक खुशी के मारे चिल्लाने लगी, माँ-माँ, मैं प्रथम आई हूँ।

Scoring of Hindi Reading Skill Test

The Hindi Reading Skill Test is quite easy based upon standard I and Standard II levels. It is expected that all the students; especially those studying in standards III, IV and V; should be able to attempt the four sets of the test with ease and complete accuracy. Still, in order to eliminate the chance factor, the following scoring procedure was adopted.

1. Students are required to recognize and read aloud each of the ten letters given in section-I in clear voice and with correct pronunciation. If a child is able to recognize and read at least 8 letters correctly and comfortably, he/she is placed at Level-I.
2. Students are required to read aloud each of the ten words given in Section-II in clear voice and with correct pronunciation. If a child reads at least 8 words correctly and with ease, he/she is placed at Level-II.

3. Students are required to read aloud the four sentences given in section-III in clear voice and with correct pronunciation. If a child reads the text fluently, with ease, like sentences (rather than a string of words) and does not make more than three mistakes, he/she is placed at Level-III.
4. Students are required to read aloud the story consisting of eight sentences given in section-IV in clear voice and with correct pronunciation. If a child reads the story fluently, with ease, like sentences (rather than a string of words) and does not make more than four mistakes, he/she is placed at Level-IV.

Administration of Hindi Reading Skill Test

The four sections of Hindi Reading Skill Test are administered in reverse order. This means that at first the students are presented individually section-4 of the test i.e. the story consisting of eight sentences. Those children who are able to read the story fluently, with ease, like sentences (rather than a string of words) and do not make more than four mistakes, are placed at Level-IV. The students who are not able to read the story fluently, with ease, like sentences (rather than a string of words) and make more than four mistakes are presented section-3 of the test i.e. four sentences. Those children who are able to read the sentences fluently, with ease, like sentences (rather than a string of words) and do not make more than three mistakes, are placed at Level-III. The students who are not able to read the sentences fluently, with ease, like sentences (rather than a string of words) and make more than three mistakes are presented section-2 of the test i.e. list of ten words. Those children who are able to read at least 8 words correctly, in clear voice, with correct pronunciation and with ease, are placed at Level-II. The children who are not able to read at least 8 words correctly, in clear voice, with correct pronunciation and with ease, are presented section-1 of the test i.e. list of ten letters. Those children who are able to read at least 8 words correctly, in clear voice, with correct pronunciation and with ease, are placed at Level-I. The children who are not able to read at least 8 words correctly, in clear voice, with correct pronunciation and with ease, are not considered worthy to be placed even at Level-1.

The Hindi Reading Skill Test was administered and scored according to the procedure. The number of total students (irrespective of class) as well as class-wise studying in government and private primary schools reaching different levels in Hindi Reading Skill are shown in Tables 1 and 2.

Table 1: Number of total students (irrespective of class) studying in government and private primary schools reaching different levels in Hindi Reading Skill

Type of School	Number of Students Reaching Different Levels of Achievement in Hindi Reading Skill				Total
	1	2	3	4	
Government	64 (06.40%)	97 (09.70%)	181 (18.10%)	658 (65.80%)	1000 (100.00%)
Private	08 (00.80%)	27 (02.70%)	168 (16.80%)	797 (79.70%)	1000 (100.00%)
Total	72 (03.60%)	124 (06.20%)	349 (17.45%)	1455 (72.75%)	2000 (100.00%)

Table 2: Number of class-wise students studying in government and private primary schools reaching different levels in Hindi Reading Skill

Class	School Type	Class-Wise Hindi Reading Skill Level				Total
		I	II	III	IV	
I	Government	36 (18.00%)	54 (27.00%)	77 (38.50%)	33 (16.50%)	200 (100.00%)
	Private	07 (03.50%)	20 (10.00%)	87 (43.50%)	86 (43.00%)	200 (100.00%)
	Total	43 (10.75%)	74 (18.50%)	164 (41.00%)	119 (29.75%)	400 (100.00%)
II	Government	24 (12.00%)	28 (14.00%)	49 (24.50%)	099 (49.50%)	200 (100.00%)
	Private	00	03	43	154	200

		(00.00%)	(01.50%)	(21.50%)	(77.00%)	(100.00%)
	Total	24 (06.00%)	31 (07.75%)	92 (23.00%)	253 (63.25%)	400 (100.00%)
III	Government	02 (01.00%)	13 (06.50%)	34 (17.00%)	151 (75.50%)	200 (100.00%)
	Private	00 (00.00%)	01 (00.50%)	24 (12.00%)	175 (87.50%)	200 (100.00%)
	Total	02 (00.50%)	14 (03.50%)	58 (14.50%)	326 (81.50%)	400 (100.00%)
IV	Government	03 (01.50%)	03 (01.50%)	17 (08.50%)	177 (88.50%)	200 (100.00%)
	Private	00 (00.00%)	01 (00.50%)	12 (06.00%)	187 (93.50%)	200 (100.00%)
	Total	03 (0.75%)	04 (01.00%)	29 (07.25%)	364 (90.75%)	400 (100.00%)
V	Government	00 (00.00%)	00 (00.00%)	05 (02.50%)	195 (97.50%)	200 (100.00%)
	Private	00 (00.00%)	01 (00.50%)	01 (00.50%)	198 (99.00%)	200 (100.00%)
	Total	00 (00.00%)	01 (00.25%)	06 (01.50%)	393 (98.25%)	400 (100.00%)
		72	124	349	1455	2000

Table 1 reveals that performance of students studying in private schools appears to be better in Hindi Reading in comparison to those studying in government schools especially at levels I, II and IV when all the classes are taken together.

When the level of performance in Hindi Reading is analyzed class-wise, it is found that performance of students studying in private primary schools is better for classes I, II and III in comparison to those studying in government primary schools. But quite interestingly, the gap in performance of two types of schools in Hindi Reading starts narrowing from class III and at class V the level of performance of students of both types of schools is nearly the same.

Apart from comparison of students of two types of schools, it may be said that in view of the level of Hindi Reading Skill Test it was expected that all the students irrespective of class should have been able to reach level IV. However, in the light of the obtained results it may be said that the performance of students studying in government as well as private primary schools in Hindi Reading is not up to the mark.

Hindi Writing Skill

The Hindi Writing Skill Test consisted of four sections – letters, words, paragraph and a story which was meant for students of classes I to V.

Letters: This section consists of a set of ten letters from Hindi alphabet.

Words: This section consists of ten common familiar words with two letters and one or two matras.

Sentences: This section consists of a set of four simple linked sentences, each having not more than 5 words. These words or their equivalent are in the standard I text book of the state.

Story: This section consists of 9 sentences. Sentence construction is straight forward, words are common and the context is familiar to the children. These words or their equivalent are in the standard II text books of the state.

The preliminary drafts of four sections of Hindi Writing Skill Test prepared by adopting the concept of Hindi Reading Skill Test were shown to some primary school teachers. The teachers were made acquainted with the purpose of test and were requested to give suggestions with respect to the choice of words and sentences and difficulty level of the content. Only one change was made on the basis of their suggestions. This also ensured the content validity of the test. The final draft of four sections of the Hindi Writing Skill Test is given below.

लिखने की जाँच

अक्षर

प	क	थ
न	ह	
म	ठ	र
फ	ज्ञ	

शब्द

पानी	गुरू	नाला
पेड़	माता	
घोड़ा	खीर	गीत
मेला	काफी	

अनुच्छेद

आओ मिल कर खेलें खेल,
देखो जंगल में एक रेल।
'मधुर' का देखा साहस निराला,
छोटा सा पर बड़े दिलवाला।

कहानी

नदी के किनारे एक गाँव था। गाँव के अधिकतर लोग खेतीबाड़ी करते थे। कुछ लोग लोहे के औज़ार और कुछ मिट्टी के बर्तन बनाते थे। अनीता कपड़े बुनती और रमेश जूते बनाता था। उस गाँव में शीला और किशन अपनी माँ के साथ रहते थे। नदी किनारे उनके दो खेत थे। वे दोनों बहुत मेहनती थे। वे तीनों सुख पूर्वक अपना जीवन व्यतीत करते थे।

Scoring of Hindi Writing Skill Test

The Hindi Writing Skill Test is quite easy based upon standard I and standard II levels. It is expected that all the students; especially those studying in standards III, IV and V; should be able to attempt the four sets of the test with ease and complete accuracy. Still, in order to eliminate the chance factor, the following scoring procedure was adopted.

1. The investigator will say aloud in clear voice and with correct pronunciation each of the ten letters given in section-1 and the students are required to write each letter on the paper provided to them by the investigator. If a child is able to write at least 8 letters correctly, he/she is placed at Level-I.
2. The investigator will say aloud in clear voice and with correct pronunciation each of the ten words given in section-2 and the students are required to write each word on the paper provided to them by the investigator. If a child is able to write at least 8 words correctly, he/she is placed at Level-II.
3. The investigator will say aloud in clear voice and with correct pronunciation each of the four sentences given in section-3 and the students are required to write each of the four sentences on the paper provided to them by the investigator. If a child does not make more than three mistakes, he/she is placed at Level-III.
4. The investigator will say aloud in clear voice and with correct pronunciation each of the nine sentences of the story given in section-4 and the students are required to write each of the sentences of the story on the paper provided to them by the investigator. If a child does not make more than four mistakes, he/she is placed at Level-IV.

Administration of Hindi Writing Skill Test

The four sections of Hindi Writing Skill Test are administered in reverse order. This means that at first the students are dictated section-4 of the test i.e. the story consisting of nine sentences. Those children, who do not make more than four mistakes, are placed at Level-IV. The students who make more than four mistakes are dictated section-3 of the test i.e. four sentences. Those children, who do not make more than three mistakes, are placed at Level-III. The students who make more than three mistakes are dictated section-2 of the test i.e. list of ten words. Those children, who are able to write at least 8 words correctly, are placed at Level-II. The children who are not able to write at least 8 words correctly, are dictated section-1 of the test i.e. list of ten letters. Those children who are able to write at least 8 words correctly are placed at Level-I. The children who are not able to write at least 8 words correctly are not considered worthy to be placed even at Level-1.

The Hindi Writing Skill Test was administered and scored according to the procedure. The number of total students (irrespective of class) as well as class-wise studying in government and private primary schools reaching different levels in Hindi Writing Skill are shown in Tables 3 and 4.

Table 3: Number of students studying in government and private primary schools reaching different levels in Hindi Writing Skill

Type of School	Number of Students Reaching Different Levels of Achievement in Hindi Writing Skill				Total
	I	II	III	IV	
Government	150 (15.00%)	315 (31.00%)	408 (40.80%)	127 (12.70%)	1000 (100.00%)
Private	66 (06.60%)	203 (20.30%)	500 (50.00%)	231 (23.10%)	1000 (100.00%)
Total	216 (10.80%)	518 (25.90%)	908 (45.40%)	358 (17.90%)	2000 (100.00%)

Table 4: Number of class-wise students studying in government and private primary schools reaching different levels in Hindi Writing Skill

Class	School Type	Class-Wise Hindi Writing Skill Level				Total
		I	II	III	IV	
I	Government	81 (40.50%)	88 (44.00%)	31 (15.50%)	0 (00.00%)	200 (100.00%)
	Private	44 (22.00%)	75 (37.50%)	80 (40.00%)	1 (00.50%)	200 (100.00%)
	Total	125 (31.25%)	163 (40.75%)	111 (27.75%)	1 (00.25%)	400 (100.00%)
II	Government	43 (21.50%)	87 (43.50%)	69 (34.50%)	1 (00.50%)	200 (100.00%)
	Private	19 (09.50%)	50 (25.00%)	114 (57.00%)	17 (08.50%)	200 (100.00%)
	Total	62 (15.50%)	137 (34.25%)	183 (45.75%)	18 (04.50%)	400 (100.00%)
III	Government	17 (08.50%)	79 (39.50%)	100 (50.00%)	04 (02.00%)	200 (100.00%)
	Private	03 (01.50%)	42 (21.00%)	118 (59.00%)	37 (18.50%)	200 (100.00%)
	Total	20 (05.00%)	121 (30.25%)	218 (54.50%)	41 (10.25%)	400 (100.00%)
IV	Government	09 (04.50%)	44 (22.00%)	117 (58.50%)	30 (15.00%)	200 (100.00%)
	Private	00 (00.00%)	24 (12.00%)	117 (58.50%)	59 (29.50%)	200 (100.00%)
	Total	09 (02.25%)	68 (17.00%)	234 (58.50%)	89 (22.25%)	400 (100.00%)
V	Government	00 (00.00%)	21 (10.50%)	90 (45.00%)	89 (44.50%)	200 (100.00%)
	Private	00 (00.00%)	08 (04.00%)	72 (36.00%)	120 (60.00%)	200 (100.00%)
	Total	00 (00.00%)	29 (07.25%)	162 (40.50%)	209 (52.25%)	400 (100.00%)
		216	518	908	358	2000

Table 3 reveals that performance of students studying in private primary schools appears to be better in Hindi Writing in comparison to those studying in government schools at levels I, II, III and IV when all the classes are taken together.

When the level of performance in Hindi Writing is analyzed class-wise, it is found that performance of students studying in private primary schools is better for classes I, II, III, IV and V in comparison to those studying in government primary schools. However, the difference in performance in Hindi Writing between students of two types of schools is not so sharp for classes IV and V.

Apart from comparison of students of two types of schools, it may be said that in view of the level of Hindi Writing Skill Test it was expected that all the students irrespective of class should have been able to reach level IV. However, in the light of the obtained results it may be said that the performance of students studying in government as well as private primary schools in Hindi Writing is not up to the mark.

In view of the results discussed above in respect of performance of students studying in government and private primary schools in respect of Hindi Reading Skill and Hindi Writing Skill, the hypothesis that “*The students studying in government and private primary schools differ significantly with respect to their level of achievement in Hindi*” is partially accepted.

L. Discussion :

This is no secret that private schools are set-up for financial purposes. Owing to this fact, private schools are opened in urban or semi-urban areas where the parents can afford the fees and other school expenditures. In rural areas, the private parties do not see much scope for opening schools. Further, the population in urban areas is concentrated in a smaller area whereas in rural areas it is scattered. This is another reason for opening private schools primarily in urban or semi-urban areas.

The parents residing in urban areas tend to admit their children in private schools due to following reasons:

1. Private schools are available in abundance.
2. It is believed that quality of education is better in private schools.
3. The private schools look attractive due to uniform, general infrastructural facilities, English medium of instruction, transportation facilities etc.
4. People seem to lose faith in the quality education being provided by government schools, at times due to hearsay only.
5. The relatives and neighbours admit their children in private schools.
6. It is prestigious to admit children in private schools.

However, this is also a fact that barring a few, most of the so-called private schools are worst than government schools as far as facilities and teachers are concerned.

References

- [1]. Webster, Thomas (2000). Universal Primary Education- the Ever Receding goal. Retrieved from
- [2]. <http://www.pngbuai.com/300socialsciences/education/policy/globalization/ed-global-1.html>
- [3]. Gouda, Jitendra; Das, Kailash Chandra; Goli, Srinivas and Pou, Ladumai Maikho Apollo (2013). Government versus Private Primary Schools in India: An Assessment of Physical Infrastructure, Schooling Costs and Performance. In *International Journal of Sociology and Social Policy*, Vol. 33, No. 11/12, 13 April 2013.
- [4]. Awan, Abdul Ghafoor (2015). Comparative Analysis of Public and Private Educational Institutions: A Case Study of District Vehari-Pakistan. In *Journal of Education and Practice*, Vol. 6, No. 16, 2015, pp. 122-130. Retrieved from
- [5]. <http://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1079988.pdf>
- [6]. Varghese, N.V. (1995). School Effects on Achievement: A Study of Government and Private Aided Schools in Kerala. In *Educational Abstracts*, Vol. 6, 1999, p. 74.